

University of Groningen

The political economy of information management

Homburg, V.

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publication date:

1999

[Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database](#)

Citation for published version (APA):

Homburg, V. (1999). *The political economy of information management: a theoretical and empirical analysis of decision making regarding interorganizational information systems*. [Thesis fully internal (DIV), University of Groningen]. s.n.

Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: <https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverne-amendment>.

Take-down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): <http://www.rug.nl/research/portal>. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

The Political Economy of Information Management

A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis of Decision Making
regarding Interorganizational Information Systems

Vincent M.F. Homburg

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

The Political Economy of Information Management

A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis of Decision Making
regarding Interorganizational Information Systems

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de
Bedrijfskunde
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen
op gezag van de
Rector Magnificus, dr. D.F.J. Bosscher
in het openbaar te verdedigen op
maandag 26 april 1999
om 14.15 uur

door

Vincentius Martinus Franciscus Homburg
geboren op 9 december 1970
te Zaltbommel

Promotores

Prof. dr. ir. J.L. Simons
Prof. dr. H.W.M. Gazendam

This thesis is dedicated to Ine
(1958 - 1996)

Promotiecommissie

Prof. dr. B. Nooteboom
Prof. dr. ir. R. Maes
Prof. drs. B.K. Brussaard

Labyrint Publication
Postbus 662
2900 AR Capelle a/d IJssel
The Netherlands

Drukwerk: Ridderprint

ISBN 90-72591-67-4

© 1999, V.M.F. Homburg

Alle rechten voorbehouden. Niets uit deze uitgave mag worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op eniger wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen, of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system of any nature, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying or recording, without prior written permission of the publisher.

Hoewel bij deze uitgave de uiterste zorg is nagestreefd, kan voor de aanwezigheid van eventuele (druk)fouten en onvolledigheden niet worden ingestaan en aanvaarden auteur en uitgever deswege geen aansprakelijkheid.

Preface

In 1994, I joined the Faculty of Management and Organization of the University of Groningen as a Ph.D. student. Now, more than four years later, I think I can say that during my research, I picked up a fascination for the rich insights organization theory provides and I can only hope that this fascination shows in this thesis.

This thesis could not have been completed without the encouragement and support of a vast number of people, some of whom I would like to mention specifically.

First of all, thank you to John Simons and Henk Gazendam. Their guidance and support have proven to be indispensable to me in completing this thesis.

Furthermore, I would like to mention my (former) colleagues in the Faculty of Management and Organization. Without the discussions with Ad Breukel, Hans van den Broek, Constantijn Heesen, Tomas Klos, Han Numan, Margriet Offereins and Johan Oldenkamp, this thesis would probably never have been realized.

For the last two years, I have been involved in the Edispuut, a discussion forum for researchers working in the field of electronic commerce and interorganizational information systems. The Edispuut members' criticism, comments and encouragement (in that order) have inspired me enormously and created the feeling that I was not the only researcher struggling in the complicated world of organizations, decision making and information systems.

I am indebted to all members of the research community who defied the economic and political logic set out in this thesis by unselfishly publishing their thoughts, articles and theses on the Internet, thereby making it accessible to me and other researchers all over the world.

Also I would like to thank the members of my dissertation committee, professor Nooteboom, professor Maes and professor Brussaard, for their comments on this thesis.

Finally, I am indebted to my friends and family.

Arwin Nimis, Ivan Pouwels and Ed Stijnen have, over the last nine years or so, shared their friendship with me by, among many other things, having heated discussions about the sense of being AIO.

My family has gone through tough times, but nevertheless they have always provided the proper encouragement, in particular by not continuously asking how the thesis was progressing and by trusting that me eventually it would be finished.

I end this preface by mentioning Claudia, for her love and for sharing her life with me.

Vincent M.F. Homburg
Groningen / Zwolle, October 1998

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	VII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 SUBJECT OF THE STUDY	1
1.2 MOTIVATION OF THE STUDY	7
1.3 PRELIMINARY RESEARCH GOAL	17
1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS.....	18
1.5 RESEARCH DESIGN.....	21
1.6 THESIS OUTLINE	32
2 VARIETY IN INFORMATION MANAGEMENT.....	35
2.1 INTRODUCTION	35
2.2 KEY DEFINITIONS.....	36
2.3 INFORMATION MANAGEMENT IN ORGANIZATION STUDIES	45
2.4 INFORMATION MANAGEMENT IN INFORMATION SYSTEMS RESEARCH	51
2.5 INTERORGANIZATIONAL INFORMATION MANAGEMENT	65
2.6 APPLICATIONS OF INTERORGANIZATIONAL INFORMATION MANAGEMENT	67
2.7 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	72
3 VARIETY IN INTERORGANIZATIONAL COORDINATION	77
3.1 INTRODUCTION	77
3.2 INTERORGANIZATIONAL RELATIONS IN ORGANIZATION THEORY	77
3.3 ECONOMIC ORGANIZATION THEORY	82
3.4 POLITICAL ORGANIZATION THEORY.....	102
3.5 SYNTHESIZING PERSPECTIVES.....	111
3.6 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	119
4 THE RESEARCH FRAMEWORK	123
4.1 INTRODUCTION	123
4.2 SOME COMMENTS ON THEORY BUILDING	124
4.3 INTRODUCTION TO THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF INFORMATION MANAGEMENT	126
4.4 APPLICATION OF ECONOMIC ORGANIZATION THEORY TO INFORMATION	
MANAGEMENT	132
4.5 APPLICATION OF POLITICAL ORGANIZATION THEORY TO INFORMATION	
MANAGEMENT	142
4.6 ASSUMPTIONS, PROPOSITIONS AND HYPOTHESES OF THE POLITICAL ECONOMY	
OF INFORMATION MANAGEMENT	145
4.7 THE REVISED RESEARCH DESIGN.....	150
4.8 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	151

5	CASES OF INTERORGANIZATIONAL INFORMATION SYSTEMS.....	153
5.1	INTRODUCTION	153
5.2	CASE 1: RESEARCH INFORMATION.....	154
5.3	CASE 2: FISCAL POLICY.....	174
5.4	CASE 3: SOCIAL SECURITY	180
5.5	SUMMARY	197
6	CONCLUSIONS	199
6.1	INTRODUCTION	199
6.2	RECAPITULATION: SUMMARIZING THE ARGUMENT.....	200
6.3	THEORETICAL CONCLUSIONS	201
6.4	CONFRONTATION OF THE THEORY WITH EMPIRICAL DATA.....	206
6.5	EPILOGUE: THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF INFORMATION MANAGEMENT	210
	LITERATURE.....	215
	SAMENVATTING	239

TABLE OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Rationales for interorganizational relationships (adapted from Oliver, 1990) .	6
Figure 2: Summary of the debate over IT and organizational structure.....	10
Figure 3: Summary of debate over ICT and interorganizational coordination	13
Figure 4: Elements of the regulative cycle.....	22
Figure 5: Regulative cycle	23
Figure 6: Elements of the empirical cycle	23
Figure 7: Empirical cycle.....	25
Figure 8: Fundamental research strategies.....	27
Figure 9: Appropriateness of research strategies	28
Figure 10: Structure of the thesis	32
Figure 11: Contents of chapters (summary).....	33
Figure 12: Stages of EDI integration	41
Figure 13: Information management tasks (Gazendam, 1993)	43
Figure 14: Strategy formation.....	48
Figure 15: Mintzberg's schools of strategy formation.....	49
Figure 16: Evolution in IT emphasis (adapted from Wassenaar, 1995).....	51
Figure 17: Relationship between information management schools and strategy schools	53
Figure 18: Overview of information management aspects	54
Figure 19: Van der Poel's phases of information management	58
Figure 20: Information management schools and aspects addressed.....	60
Figure 21: Overview of economic organization theories.....	86
Figure 22: Autonomy, dependence and coordination in economic organization theory (1/3)	88
Figure 23: Comparison of governance mechanisms	90
Figure 24: Governance costs (adapted from Williamson [1995, p. 199]).....	92
Figure 25: Autonomy, dependence and coordination in economic organization theory (2/3)	93
Figure 26: Autonomy, dependence and coordination in economic organization theory (3/3)	99
Figure 27: Autonomy, dependence and coordination in economic organization theory (synthesis).....	102
Figure 28: Autonomy, dependence and coordination in political organization theory (synthesis).....	111
Figure 29: Comparison of economic organization theory and political organization theory	115
Figure 30: Components of a theory (based on Bacharach, 1989)	125
Figure 31: Bacharach criteria for theories.....	126
Figure 32: Merali and McKiernan information management approaches	127
Figure 33: Configuration of interorganizational relations (adapted from Holland & Lockett, 1994).....	128
Figure 34: Configuration of interorganizational relations (adapted from Klein, 1996)	130

Figure 35: Characterization of the Higher Education and Research Case	174
Figure 36: Characterization of the Fiscal Policy Case	179
Figure 37: Overview of Dutch Social Security Schemes.....	180
Figure 38: Overview of Dutch organizations in the social security sector	181
Figure 39: Communication in the social security domain according to the RINIS initiative	189
Figure 40: Characterization of the Social Security Case	196